

0001

1

2

3

4

NEW YORK CITY TEACHERS' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

5

INVESTMENT MEETING

6

7

Held on Thursday, September 8, 2022

8

Via Videoconference

9

10:13 a.m.

10

ATTENDEES:

11

DEBRA PENNY, Chairperson, Trustee

12

DAVID KAZANSKY, Trustee

13

THOMAS BROWN, Trustee

14

SUMANTE RAY, Trustee, Mayor's Office

15

BRAD LANDER, Trustee, Comptroller

16

ALISON HIRSH, Trustee, Comptroller's Office

17

RUSSELL BUCKLEY, Trustee

18

PATRICIA REILLY, Teachers' Retirement System

19

SUSAN STANG, Teachers' Retirement System

20

ROBIN PELLISH, Rocaton

21

DEVON ALEXANDER, Rocaton

22

MICHAEL FULVIO, Rocaton

23

VALERIE BUDZIK, Teachers' Retirement System

24

REPORTED BY:

YAFFA KAPLAN

25

JOB NO. 8598345

0002

1

2

ATTENDEES (Continued):

3

LIZ SANCHEZ, Teachers' Retirement System

4

THAD McTIGUE, Teachers' Retirement System

5

DAVID LEVINE, Groom Law Group

6

STEVEN MEIER, Comptroller's Office

7

JOHN DORSA, Comptroller's Office

8

KOMIL ATAIEV, Teachers' Retirement System

9

ISAAC GLOVINSKY, Teachers' Retirement System

10

PETYA NIKALOVA, Bureau of Asset Management

11

KATE VISCONTI, Bureau of Asset Management

12

KIM BOSTON, Bureau of Asset Management

13

TINA SUO, Bureau of Asset Management

14

SIMON LIANG, Bureau of Asset Management

15

MITCH FIELDING, Bureau of Asset Management

16

ED BERMAN, Bureau of Asset Management

17

DAN HAAS, Bureau of Asset Management

18

JIMMY YAN, Bureau of Asset Management

19

HYDE HSU, Bureau of Asset Management

20

MORAIMA PARES, Bureau of Asset Management

21

BLAIR BARBERINO, Bureau of Asset Management

22

WILFREDO SUAREZ, Bureau of Asset Management

23

JOHN ADLER, Mayor's Office

24

TOM CARROLL, Bureau of Asset Management

25

GREGORY ZELIKOVSKY, Office of the Actuary

0003

1
2 ATTENDEES:
3 KEVIN BALOAD
4 DEV SUBHASH, StepStone
5 YING LIN, StepStone
6 JAMES MAINA, StepStone
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

0004

1 Proceedings
2 MS. REILLY: Good morning. Welcome to
3 the investment meeting of the Teachers'
4 Retirement Board for September 8, 2022. I
5 will start by calling the roll.
6 Bryan Berge?
7 MR. RAY: Suman Ray for the Mayor's
8 Office.
9 MS. REILLY: Thomas Brown?
10 MR. BROWN: Present. Good morning,
11 Patricia.
12 MS. REILLY: Russell Buckley?
13 MR. BUCKLEY: On behalf of Panel For
14 Educational Policy Chair Dr. Angela Green and
15 Interim CFO Benjamin Schanback, I am here.
16 MS. REILLY: Alison Hirsh?
17 MS. HIRSH: Here on behalf of
18 Comptroller Lander.
19 MS. REILLY: David Kazansky?
20 MR. KAZANSKY: Present.
21 MS. REILLY: Debra Penny?
22 MS. PENNY: Present.
23 MS. REILLY: We have a quorum. I will
24 turn it over to you.
25 MS. PENNY: Thank you so much. Thank

0005

1 Proceedings
2 you.

3 Good morning, everyone. Welcome back.
4 Happy First Day of School to all of our public
5 school children and teachers. We are going to
6 start with a welcome and a little opening by
7 our comptroller, Mr. Brad Lander.

8 MR. LANDER: Thank you so much, Deb.

9 It's really actually so nice to be here
10 on a first day of school. I did a first day
11 of school visit this morning in Brooklyn at
12 Arts & Letters 305 United, really great public
13 elementary, K through 8 actually. And really
14 special to have the Teachers' Retirement
15 System meeting on the first day and especially
16 this year when, you know, last year's opening
17 still so full of pandemic anxiety. Not that
18 those are all behind us by a long shot, but
19 still it really felt like the first day of
20 school today just with that immense sense of
21 possibility for these kids.

22 Actually my favorite was one of the
23 classrooms I went into, the teacher had done
24 first day feels and the kids all got stickies
25 and they had all columns excited, happy. But

0006

1 Proceedings
2 then a few kids admitted nervous, scared,
3 anxious. And just what our teachers, our
4 educators, and our principals make possible is
5 extraordinary. Like it really is the
6 foundation of our democracy, the foundation of
7 our city's economy, the possibility of making
8 this crazy, wonderful, diverse, messy city
9 work together. So much of that comes from
10 what happened in our public schools. So to
11 have the responsibility of making sure those
12 teachers and educators and administrators know
13 that for the hard work they are doing they
14 have got retirement security, it feels like an
15 extra sacred duty today. So it's an honor to
16 be here with you.

17 And it's also -- I will just say I --
18 it's been good. I have seen David out at a
19 number of as part of the work to make sure
20 those schools themselves are robustly funded,
21 the teachers are getting the resources they
22 need to do the work in the classrooms, as we
23 are doing the work to make sure that their
24 retirement security is invested soundly and
25 will be there for them when they leave. So

0007

1 Proceedings
2 fun and an honor to be here.

3 Also great to be here at my first
4 meeting of Teachers' Retirement System with

5 Steve Meier. I know a lot of you got to meet
6 him through the interview process or met him
7 already, but to do sort of a formal
8 introduction, we are really excited to have
9 Steve on as our new chief investment officer.
10 And I know he takes really seriously the
11 service orientation of working with our
12 partners, our labor trustees, our other
13 public sector trustees, and really
14 understanding that what we are doing is
15 providing kind of stewardship advice,
16 custodianship, and service to this set of
17 people who are leading and making that set of
18 decisions on these issues and trying to do it
19 on the most transparent and thoughtful and
20 prudent way that we possibly can. I am also
21 excited about the fact that we do it with
22 such attention to stewardship of those funds
23 and fiduciary duties and a broad sense of
24 responsibility.

25 So it was wonderful to join with you all

0008

1 Proceedings
2 just a couple of days ago as part of the
3 effort to make sure that through the
4 shareholder action we are talking on through
5 MasterCard, that guns are better tracked. And
6 I understand the vote at the International
7 Standards Organization about whether to create
8 a merchant category code for standalone gun
9 stores is likely to take place today or
10 tomorrow so fingers crossed that goes in the
11 right direction, but whether it does or not
12 today or tomorrow, that action is really
13 powerful and important.

14 We were part of our work together to
15 file a shareholder resolution yesterday at
16 Apple who have human rights possibly that make
17 clear that their workers, like our New York
18 City workers, have freedom of association and
19 can make decisions about whether they want to
20 join the union, but there is some reason to be
21 concerned that Apple for all their good
22 products and good investment returns is not
23 following that policy. So we asked them to
24 file the shareholder resolution that would
25 require them to have an accounting for the gap

0009

1 Proceedings
2 between what their stated International Labour
3 Organization policy is and what their actions
4 have been.

5 And then especially excited today to
6 know that we are almost entirely complete with

7 the direction of this Board to divest public
8 equities from fossil fuel reserve owners. I
9 was excited to see over the summer that the
10 American Federation of Teachers is lifting up
11 the work for net zero and prudent climate
12 investment all across the country and
13 obviously knowing that we here at TRS have
14 been the forefront of that work. You know,
15 kind of digging in and doing the hard work of
16 identifying those companies, of doing it in a
17 prudent way, of doing it alongside investment
18 in climate solutions and renewables and
19 showing that it's prudent and responsible
20 investment is really exciting, so honored to
21 be a big part of that. I want to say a big
22 thank you to this Board for the partnership in
23 all of that work.

24 I don't get to come all the time, but I
25 always appreciate Alison keeping me very up to

0010

1 Proceedings
2 date on what you guys are doing. And I think
3 when I came in now eight months ago, seven
4 months ago, you know, I made the commitment
5 that Steve is about to pick up but that we
6 really are taking seriously to understand that
7 it's a role of partnership, dual relationship,
8 and the trustees who are making the decisions
9 who have the responsibilities set on the
10 trustees individually and collectively by the
11 members. So I hope you feel like we are
12 living up to that set of promises that we
13 made. If you see opportunities for us to
14 continue to do better, I know that Steve and
15 Alison and I and our whole team in the
16 Comptroller's Office at the Bureau of Asset
17 Management are really deeply, deeply
18 committed.

19 MS. PENNY: We appreciate that. And on
20 behalf of our members, we really appreciate
21 the work that you do with the resolutions,
22 especially the one with the MasterCard and
23 tracking gun purchases. Mike Garland has been
24 doing an awesome job with the proxy committee
25 right in line with the Teachers, what they

0011

1 Proceedings
2 feel and what they are committed to, so we
3 really appreciate that work so thank you.
4 So I guess we are ready to continue, so
5 we are going to go to the quarterly
6 performance. And, Steve, you are on deck.

7 MR. MEIER: Great.

8 Thank you very much and good morning,

9 everyone. So I am actually going to go a
10 little out of order. I am going to give a
11 market update.

12 MS. PENNY: Don't mess up my order now.
13 All right.

14 MR. MEIER: Given the current
15 circumstances of the market, probably makes
16 sense to talk about a little bit what's going
17 on in the world for context around
18 performance. So again thank you, thrilled to
19 be here. I should -- also full disclosure, I
20 should mention that I am originally from
21 New York. I grew up in New Jersey, my wife is
22 from Brooklyn, and my wife is actually a
23 school teacher who did her graduate school
24 training here in New York City as well, and my
25 mother was a school teacher as well. So I am

0012

1 Proceedings

2 more than happy to be here.

3 I am going to give you an overview
4 what's going on in the market, but I am also
5 consistently going to try to provide you with
6 a couple of themes that recur and we should
7 always be mindful of as we help you manage
8 these pension assets. And, firstly, that's
9 the focus on long-term outcomes, the benefits
10 associated with diversification of investing,
11 viewing the world through a global lens. The
12 U.S. is not an island. There is a lot going
13 on in the world that's impacting currency,
14 capital flows and our domestic markets as
15 well, and lastly investing consistently over
16 time as opposed to trying to time the markets.

17 On the next slide -- Kate, one more,
18 please. This is actually a headline of an
19 article that I saw a little over two years
20 that really caught my eye. What it emphasizes
21 -- this is a sincere article. It emphasizes
22 the long tail that these pension promises
23 hold. This one happens to be 155 years this
24 women, Irene Triplett, was actually the
25 daughter of a Civil War veteran who fought for

0013

1 Proceedings

2 ironically both the South and the North,
3 retired with a pension, and as a pensioner
4 with income in the 1920s was considered hot
5 property. He married a woman 50 years younger
6 than him and fathered Irene at the healthy old
7 age of 83 and Ms. Triplett actually lived
8 until she was 90 years old, so it really gives
9 you a sense that we have the luxury to think
10 on a long-term basis as opposed to worrying

11 about every little thing in the market.
12 The next slide is actually one of my
13 favorite charts. This is the Callan &
14 Associates Periodic Table of Investment
15 Returns. I think it does a great job of
16 demonstrates variability of individual asset
17 returns over time. Very hard to read, but I
18 think it still makes the point that
19 diversifying holdings across assets and
20 strategies makes sense. I think the other
21 thing I take away on the slide, and I am sure
22 the consultants in the room have picked up on
23 it already, the upper left-hand corner you can
24 see emerging markets outperformed for five
25 years pretty dramatically. That was

0014

1 Proceedings
2 associated with BRICS; Brazil, Russia, India,
3 China, and South of Africa, the buildup of
4 sale of commodities. Also, China ahead of the
5 Beijing 2008 Olympics. That would have been
6 an interesting theme to know about or to have
7 forecasted beforehand the position
8 accordingly. Full disclosure, of course, you
9 will notice the next year it's the
10 worst-performing asset class. The orange is
11 way down at the bottom and next year was up 78
12 percent, so volatility. But, again, you never
13 know which asset class is going to outperform.
14 On the next slide, again this is just --
15 I think this is from here, the United Nations
16 in New York City. Your plan's investment
17 portfolio is invested in both U.S. and
18 international assets, both private and public.
19 Our domestic economy, as I said earlier, the
20 markets are impacted by things that occur
21 beyond our national borders and I think first
22 on that list would be pandemics, talk about
23 technological innovations, monetary policies
24 at central banks, the impact on currency
25 valuations, trade flows, and country

0015

1 Proceedings
2 competitiveness. Geopolitical developments,
3 and we are feeling some of the pain there
4 associated with the war in Ukraine. We also
5 are impacted by election results, trade pacts,
6 and defensive alliances. Climate change
7 preparedness is really having an impact on
8 capital flows investments as well as the
9 physical environment and the demand for raw
10 materials. Again, this is just emphasizing
11 the fact that U.S. is not an island; we are
12 part of an integrated global economy in

13 society.

14 The next slide, I believe you have seen
15 this slide before very recently. And I
16 suspect it had a title that talked about the
17 lost decade and it talked about periods of
18 time where over 10 or 12 or even more years
19 that the 60/40 portfolio is flat and most
20 recently time would have been 1966 to '82. I
21 actually take something different away from
22 this slide. I think what it shows you is that
23 it's time in the market, meaning being an
24 consistent investor as opposed to trying to
25 time the market which no one can actually

0016

1 Proceedings

2 really do well, very, very few people. But
3 when I look at it, I look at the gradual
4 upward shift over 120 years to the right in
5 terms of wealth creation again, being part of
6 the markets, being beneficiary of innovation,
7 growth of the US, and global economy. The
8 whole trend of globalization that ramped up in
9 the '90s, labor force and productivity growth
10 as well as increased standards of living
11 around the world, we want to be part of that
12 consistently.

13 The next slide, Kate, moving on to our
14 economic and market update, inflation is top
15 of mind these days both here and abroad. I am
16 sure if you open any periodical or even watch
17 the local news, you will see the inflation
18 levels are near 40-year highs which is
19 certainly a problem for the Fed. Our economy
20 is emerging from the global pandemic and
21 undergoing significant major transitions
22 called the post-pandemic headwinds. We see
23 increase in demand for goods, services, and
24 experiences while supplies still last, pushing
25 prices higher. We have also seen a pretty

0017

1 Proceedings

2 dramatic shift in monetary policy regimes both
3 here and abroad from loose to very tight with
4 higher interest rates and a quantitative
5 tightening in terms of balance sheet reduction
6 again here in the United States, a little less
7 so in Europe. We continue to see supply chain
8 bottlenecks; a lot of that is associated with
9 China's zero tolerance for COVID and their
10 policy of lockdown. We have also seen pretty
11 dramatic shortages for labor that are pushing
12 wages higher. And, lastly, we have seen an
13 increase in demand and price pressures on
14 energy, commodity prices; a lot of that has to

15 do with the Russian invasion of Ukraine.
16 On the next slide, again just
17 emphasizing the point of inflation around the
18 world; these levels of inflation on the left
19 at 6.8 percent in June, PCE here in the
20 States, CPI in Europe for July was 9.1, and
21 CPI in the UK is over 10 percent and seems to
22 be going much higher. Our economy I should
23 say, the European, and UK economies is really
24 suffering from the increase price and
25 pressures on energy in particular. What's

0018

1 Proceedings

2 going on in the marketplace really has pushed
3 inflation well beyond and well above the
4 Fed's, ECB's and Bank of England's 3 percent
5 inflation target.

6 The next slide just looks at a recent
7 University of Michigan survey which indicates
8 that there are high inflation expectations
9 which are now over 5 percent. Again, this is
10 a survey. I think the good news also you can
11 see on the top left on the right-hand side,
12 it's come off the boil a little bit. And the
13 Fed's real concern -- and I don't know if you
14 saw, maybe it was onscreen this morning at
15 9:00, he was actually talking about the
16 concern about inflation expectations becoming
17 embedded and placing consistent price pressure
18 on wages and impacting consumer behavior.

19 The next slide, getting back to oil and
20 commodity prices. This is a slide that is a
21 West Texas Intermediate crude oil spot rates
22 and you can see they have polled pretty
23 significantly higher this year. There were
24 over \$120 per barrel of oil. It's actually
25 come off significantly. This chart you can't

0019

1 Proceedings

2 see that, but in the upper 80s. It's actually
3 at \$82 per barrel today. On recessionary
4 fares the Fed is more aggressive, the ECB is
5 more aggressive, other central banks around
6 the world tighten, there is increased concern
7 there will be a recession at some point.

8 On the next slide here, we are looking
9 at employment. In July the U.S. employment
10 rate was 3.5 percent, a 50-year low. And it's
11 moved slightly higher in August up to 3.7
12 percent probably for good reasons, in that
13 there are more people joining the labor force
14 now looking for work. The participation rate,
15 you can see that's anticipated on the
16 left-hand side; the yellow line up top.

17 Participation rate is now 62.4 percent.
18 Pre-pandemic it was 63.4 percent. We are
19 still down over 2 million workers in our
20 domestic economy, again also contributing to
21 price pressures on wages. The shortage of
22 workers also made it **for difficult for
23 employers to attract, retain, and hire workers
24 in this environment. We have also demographic
25 shifts, including retirement. There has been,

0020

1 Proceedings

2 since the pandemic, 2.1 million excess
3 retirement above what was expected. We have
4 also seen low birth rates in the States which
5 I think takes a longer period of time to
6 adjust, probably 20 to 25 years. But we have
7 also seen a significant decline in immigration
8 trends, which was all made worse by the COVID
9 pandemic.

10 On the next slide, this is what's
11 referred to as the misery index over the past
12 30 years. And I don't know if you remember
13 this; I remember this from being a high school
14 student in the '70s: The misery index is
15 simply the CPI inflation, plus the
16 unemployment level. If you look at the
17 right-hand side, you can see it popped up at
18 the outset of the pandemic pretty dramatically
19 and that was driven by unemployment spiking.
20 And subsequent to some recovery, it's popped
21 up again. This is almost entirely due to the
22 high levels of inflation. Again, today's
23 misery index really underscores the fact that
24 inflation is a real problem for the average
25 citizen in the United States. A couple of fun

0021

1 Proceedings

2 facts from historical perspective, and I love
3 history and financial history: The misery
4 index actually had its highest level under
5 Jimmy Carter in 1980 at 19.72 and its lowest
6 under Dwight Eisenhower in 1953 at 2.97.

7 The next slide is a chart that really
8 shows disruption that COVID placed on GDP
9 around the world. These are five major
10 economies or zones and you can see that on the
11 right-hand side at the outset of the pandemic,
12 the spike-down in GDP was fairly universal and
13 the recoveries have been much more
14 idiosyncratic depending on monetary policy,
15 fiscal policy, and actually vaccination
16 protocols around the world.

17 I think the other interesting thing
18 about this slide, you can see the blue line is

19 just below 10 percent probably 8-1/2 percent
20 over time. That's China's economy. So for
21 the prior eight years I guess before the
22 pandemic, it was really an engine of growth
23 for the entire world economy and that's
24 certainly come off. And with their
25 zero-tolerance COVID protocol, it's really

0022

1 Proceedings

2 stretching that economy. You can see the
3 economic growth in China right now is a little
4 flat and even slightly negative here in the
5 States. I will talk a little about that in a
6 moment.

7 The next chart actually shows the
8 details in the last six quarters in terms of
9 U.S. GDP growth. On the far right-hand side,
10 you can see there is more of a downdraft than
11 there is uplift and that represents the U.S.
12 economy in the first calendar quarter of '22
13 was down 1.6 percent followed by down 0.6
14 percent. The rule of thumb typically has been
15 if you have two consecutive quarters of
16 negative GDP growth, you are in a recession.
17 I don't think that applies now because the
18 employment market is just so strong as is the
19 consumer, the consumer balance sheets are
20 strong. You can see the gray bars are all
21 positive; that represents consumer spending.
22 So it's come down a little bit, but it's still
23 pretty robust.

24 This next slide actually talks about the
25 Federal Reserve dual mandate. And actually

0023

1 Proceedings

2 when I was preparing slides for this meeting,
3 I was surprised to find this out. This is
4 actually specific language that we have taken
5 from congressional legislation from 1977 that
6 says the Fed's mandate was to achieve maximum
7 employment, stable prices, and moderate
8 long-term interest rates. And I count that as
9 three mandates, but I guess the conventional
10 wisdom is stable prices would lead to moderate
11 long-term interest rates so they kind of
12 shorten it and now it's just a dual mandate.
13 Actually, Chair Powell was on the screen today
14 answering questions. Someone asked if they
15 were in conflict with one another and he said
16 no, he still thinks they are useful. A couple
17 of other things. Fed Chair Powell has
18 recently stated his resolve to fight inflation
19 and get it back to the 2 percent target level,
20 even if it results in higher unemployment.

21 And at Jackson Hole at the end of August at
22 the economics symposium he said fighting
23 inflation will bring some pain to businesses
24 and consumers. And there is a lot of talk
25 about will the Fed be able to achieve what's

0024

1 Proceedings

2 referred to as a soft landing or a reduction
3 in inflation to their target level without
4 causing a recession. The fact they are going
5 aggressively in terms of raising rates in a
6 short period of time increases the risk of a
7 recession and the average recession results in
8 an increase in unemployment of 2 percent or
9 higher, so that's a real challenge for the Fed
10 at this point.

11 The next slide, I have to admit these
12 are two of my favorite slides. The top
13 actually shows 30 years of federal fund rate
14 changes, hikes and cuts. As a general matter
15 since 1983, it's a slightly longer period than
16 shown here, the Fed has increased interest
17 rates 86 times; 75 of those hikes have
18 actually been less than 50 basis points,
19 meaning 25 basis points. We can't say that
20 with any certainty because I don't know if you
21 remember, but before 1992 they never told you
22 how much they were cutting. They changed
23 their open market activities to reflect that.
24 I think this also underscores the fact that
25 the cycle, the Fed only began coming up the

0025

1 Proceedings

2 zero level at mark plus 25 basis points. They
3 have raised points subsequent to that 50 basis
4 points which is unusual, two subsequent hikes
5 of 75 basis points. And you can see on the
6 far right-hand side, the last time they hiked
7 75 basis points was in 1994. And, if you
8 remember, that caused all sorts of problems
9 out in California with inverse floaters and
10 Orange County defaulting on their debt.
11 Anyway, the market is still currently pricing
12 in a 75 basis point rate height for September
13 '21 followed by another 50 and another 25 in
14 November, December respectively. So the
15 expectation is that at the end of the year,
16 you will see short-term official interest
17 rates in the range of 3.75 and 4 percent. And
18 that's pretty tight relative to where it's
19 been.

20 The slide at the bottom actually is
21 actually the Goldman Sachs Financial
22 Conditions Index; that actually reflects --

23 you see the slope up to the right, on the far
24 right, and reflects tightening financial
25 conditions. And the index actually looks at

0026

1 Proceedings

2 the target Fed fund level which is great,
3 moving higher, the trade rate exchange rate
4 which is moving higher and S&P 500 which is
5 moving lower, investment grade corporate bond
6 spreads which have slightly moved higher, and
7 ten-year U.S. treasury yields which have moved
8 dramatically higher. So stay tuned. I think
9 there is a little bit more hiking and a little
10 more financial condition tightening and my
11 expectation is the Fed will be at higher
12 levels for a longer period of time, which will
13 be pretty challenging for the economy to avert
14 a recession.

15 On the next slide, higher U.S. official
16 rates and quantitative tightening and
17 tightening monetary conditions have also
18 caused the U.S. treasury yield curve to shift
19 higher. I'm sorry, this is maybe too
20 technical, but I love this stuff. You can
21 see where it's sorted out a year ago on the
22 low blue line and how low interest rates, how
23 relatively flat the yield curve was on the
24 short end and shifted higher at the beginning
25 of the year, that orange slide in the

0027

1 Proceedings

2 middle-ish. And you can see now on the top
3 line that rates have moved substantially
4 higher this year and the yield curve is
5 actually now inverted, which is a fancy way of
6 saying the short rates are higher than the
7 longer-term rates and that reflects a couple
8 of things. First, there is no real yield
9 premium that goes with buying further out the
10 curve, but also reflects monetary policy is
11 moving higher. At some point there will be a
12 risk of recession and reduction in short rates
13 again. Lastly, on the right-hand side, you
14 can see the two-year treasury yield spread to
15 ten-year treasury yield spread is in negative
16 territory now about 20 basis points. That's
17 really an unusual circumstance.

18 On the next slide it's a look at credit
19 spreads investment grade and high-yield credit
20 spreads, and this impacts your investment
21 grade corporate bonds and high-yield corporate
22 bonds. This is a way of looking at the fact
23 that when economic uncertainty increases and
24 the potential for recession increases, it

25 hurts corporate credit directly, but in
0028

1 Proceedings

2 different -- in varying amounts. So the upper
3 red bar is actually the high-yield credit
4 spreads which I am glad you can't see this
5 slide because I can't see with or without my
6 glasses on, but I don't think it's correct.
7 High-yield spreads right now are about 475
8 basis points above corresponding U.S.
9 treasuries and investment grade spreads which
10 are lower have also moved up a little bit
11 higher, about 140 basis points above
12 treasuries. And, again, that just reflects
13 that there is more uncertainty in the
14 marketplace.

15 On the next slide, this emphasizes --
16 there is a lot of information on here, but I
17 will point you to what's relevant. This
18 actually points to the fact that the pain in
19 the bond market is global. And I mentioned
20 earlier -- I think I mentioned earlier, at
21 least I thought I mentioned earlier: U.S.
22 treasury ten-year yield if you look at the far
23 right, it's the top left, it says year-to-date
24 change or "YDTD Change." Our interest rates
25 right now as of the time of this print was 150

0029

1 Proceedings

2 basis points higher, but look down the list;
3 these are all major sovereign debt issues in
4 ten years. They are all up 1, 2, 200-plus
5 basis points with one big exception and that's
6 China; it's the last one on the lower
7 right-hand side. Treasury yields there have
8 actually come down 13 basis points and that's
9 because they are actually reducing rates.
10 Their GDP growth is flat. Their policy of
11 zero COVID tolerance is really hampering the
12 economy. Right now I don't know if you read,
13 but a week ago they closed down their fourth
14 largest city which took 21 million people out
15 of the marketplace and shut down businesses.
16 In China right now there are 44 million people
17 that are in lockdown, so that policy is having
18 a negative impact on China's growth. But
19 again as you have seen in the chart earlier,
20 they also have been an engine of GDP growth
21 around the world which is now hampered.

22 On the next slide, this is really very,
23 very interesting and very unusual. The U.S.
24 dollar is incredibly strong this year. It's
25 trading at two- and three-decade highs against

0030

1

Proceedings

2 several trading pairs or current currencies
3 and this is due to the fact that our interest
4 rates have moved up higher faster here in the
5 States. We have been -- the Fed, although
6 they might have gotten religion late, they
7 have been fairly aggressive and very
8 aggressive raising rates. Our economy is
9 generally stronger. We also benefit from
10 having reserve currency status, in particular
11 oil. Everything in oil is created in dollars.
12 And, lastly, flight-to-quality buying
13 associated with geopolitical risks. Again,
14 the Russia's invasion of Ukraine and
15 sabre-rattling by China in the straits of
16 Taiwan have caused people to move into U.S.
17 dollar and out of other currencies. There is
18 a couple of impacts worth noting about the
19 strength of the dollar. Firstly, it lowers
20 earnings for U.S. companies that have
21 operations abroad. So as they sell products
22 in the UK in pounds and repatriating those
23 dollars for reporting purposes in the States,
24 they are at low levels because the pound has
25 lost value relative to the dollar. And it

0031

1

Proceedings

2 also lowers our competitiveness because as we
3 export, because the dollar is so strong, our
4 products are less competitive; they are more
5 expensive abroad. And lastly, I am trying not
6 to be so down, there is some positive news.
7 It actually lowers the imported inflation for
8 imported goods. Because of the strength of
9 the dollar, we buy at slightly lower levels
10 which helps the Fed.

11

12 The next slide I won't belabor the
13 point, I just think this is fascinating: The
14 euro versus the dollar, the pound versus the
15 dollar, and the Japanese yen versus the dollar
16 at all over 20-year lows; meaning the dollar
17 is incredibly strong. This is highly unusual.
18 And everyone talks about the euro in
19 particular. It's at parity with the dollar
20 today. Each euro buys a dollar whereas back
21 15 years ago, a euro bought a \$1.58.

21

22 The next slide, now we are moving more
23 into the meat around investments. These
24 slides are for the past 30 years and on the
25 left-hand side it actually shows volatility,
the volatility index or the VIX which is

0032

1

Proceedings

2 derived from the S&P Index options pricing.

3 It's fancy, but what it really shows is the
4 volatility of stock prices have picked up.
5 This is referred to also as the Wall Street
6 Fear Index and the higher it is, the more fear
7 there is in the marketplace. And there is a
8 saying -- it's pithy; I don't know if it
9 really impacts how we make investment
10 decisions. The saying anyway goes when the
11 VIX is high, it's time to buy and when the VIX
12 is low, it's time to go. That basically means
13 be a contrarian. When there is more concern
14 and more uncertainty in the marketplace and
15 more volatility, it's better to step in. On
16 the right-hand side, this is a similar slide
17 that shows the MOVE index for bonds. It's the
18 Merrill Lynch Options Volatility Estimate.
19 Similarly, it looks at options pricing at 2's,
20 5's, 10's, and 30's treasuries. You can see
21 that's moved up pretty substantially as well.
22 On the next slide talking about general
23 market returns, the left-hand side actually
24 shows that over the past 20 years equity index
25 gains have dominated. If you look at that

0033

1 Proceedings
2 cluster of returns between zero and 10
3 percent, that's for U.S., non-U.S, and Russell
4 3000 broad U.S. stock prices. So generally
5 there is uplift associated with investing in
6 equities certainly over the last 20 years. On
7 the far right-hand side, you can see all three
8 pairs have been down for the first and second
9 quarter of calendar year 2022. We have
10 experienced in S&P 500 the worst first-half
11 performance since 1962, down 20 percent. And
12 note that the S&P 500 has been down 22 in the last
13 30 years. It's been down only eight years.
14 On average, it's up 10 percent. Worse, it's
15 been down 38 percent and at best it's been up
16 34 percent. And on the far right-hand side,
17 this is an even more remarkable slide I
18 believe and it shows Bloomberg Barclays
19 Aggregate Index and it's remarkably negative
20 recently. Look on the far right-hand side how
21 far down that is. The U.S. Ag had its worse
22 first-half performance since 1976, down 10.3
23 percent. Ten-year U.S. treasuries, I don't
24 know how they calculated this. But I can
25 promise if someone has a question, I will get

0034

1 Proceedings
2 the answer. U.S. ten-year treasury had their
3 worst first-half performance since 1788. I
4 don't think the government was issuing debt

5 back then, so I suspect they probably used New
6 York City bonds or some manner of local bonds
7 at a proxy. I am looking at the consultant.
8 I have a book on it, but I don't have it here.

9 And I would say the last point I would
10 make is the U.S. Ag has been up 26 of the past
11 30 years. Its best return for the full year
12 was up 18 percent. Its worst return was down
13 negative 3 percent. And year to date in 2022,
14 it's down over 10 percent. So, again, these
15 are really extraordinary times.

16 The next slide, it actually reflects --
17 this is a great slide. It reflects the full
18 fiscal year of 2022. So on the left, that's
19 the second half of calendar year 2021. In the
20 middle, it's the first half of calendar year
21 2022. And on the far right, that's the
22 results for the full fiscal year 2022. You
23 can see on the left that the year is off to a
24 pretty good start. Obviously emerging markets
25 equities have had some headwind down 9-plus

0035

1 Proceedings
2 percent, but the other markets are actually
3 holding their own. There is a dramatic
4 drawdown in stock and bond prices in the first
5 half of this year, calendar year, second half
6 fiscal year that overpowered any returns we
7 saw in the first half. You can see the
8 product is in the far right-hand side;
9 negative returns across the board. There is
10 one exception here and that's oil, and WTI oil
11 is up 43 percent for the year.

12 On the next slide, actually this chart
13 shows the relative outperformance of U.S.
14 stocks relative to non-U.S. stocks and
15 emerging market stocks. On the left-hand
16 side, that dark line I can't see. It's dark
17 blue. It looks blue here, but I thought it
18 was black. The cumulative returns for U.S.
19 equities have been very substantially higher
20 than those four in the red. Developed ex-U.S.
21 and emerging markets in blue. The middle
22 chart actually shows the performance for
23 fiscal year 2022. Again, you can see it's
24 performed relatively well in the first half
25 and then down significantly in the second

0036

1 Proceedings
2 half. And finally the chart on the right-hand
3 side shows fiscal year-to-date performance
4 2023. It's really two months of data. You
5 can see they had a pretty substantial rally in
6 July and then sell-off in August as well now

7 in terms of performance. So I set the table
8 and I hope I have managed expectations down.
9 I tried to be fair and honest. It's been a
10 tough marketplace in which to invest, as
11 indicated earlier. Public markets assets and
12 investments have actually been under
13 significant negative pressure in 2022.

14 Actually, can you go to the next slide,
15 Kate? Thanks. As a result, performance
16 across all public markets was negative for
17 both the second quarter 2022 and the full
18 fiscal year 2022. You can see that reflected
19 here. Those two columns that stick out like
20 sore red thumbs reflect those negative
21 performances. The good news is all the
22 five-year returns -- again thinking with the
23 long-term hat, wearing a long-term hat,
24 thinking from a long-term perspective the past
25 five years of cumulative returns have all been

0037

1 Proceedings
2 positive. That's relative even in regards to
3 U.S. equities relative to the expected
4 returns. Those expected returns, I have to
5 caveat those are over a ten-year investment
6 horizon. Those are based on the capital
7 market assumptions so we still have five years
8 to get above and beyond those levels, but
9 again U.S. equities held up and performed
10 reasonably well irrespective of all these
11 outcomes.

12 Are there any questions? I should have
13 said that upfront. There is no such thing as
14 a bad question, but there might be a bad
15 answer for me. But I will try to be more
16 transparent.

17 MR. KAZANSKY: We learned as trustees
18 every question we ask is a great question.

19 MR. MEIER: I learned that as well. Now
20 that I am on the buy side for New York City,
21 my jokes are funnier, I am better looking.

22 The next slide, Kate. Actually reflects
23 again the market has been very challenging in
24 all areas. This is actually the Teachers'
25 Retirement System net public market returns by

0038

1 Proceedings
2 strategy. And we have got the benefit of John
3 Merseburg with U.S.; he is going to do a
4 deeper dive in equities. I will leave it to
5 him to talk about performance in equities
6 specifically. In the fixed income space on
7 the lower part of the chart, you can see the
8 performance has been challenging as well.

9 Again for the full fiscal year, but perhaps
10 outperforming some of the benchmarks. And
11 again here I think the takeaway, the long-term
12 view, the five-year returns have been all
13 positive. The one area that really shines is
14 cash. I say that with a smile because we
15 technically have a zero allocation, but cash
16 is king and is generating positive returns for
17 that period of time.

18 On the next slide, this is much better
19 news. I wanted to end on a higher note.
20 These are private market returns by strategy.
21 And you can see there's been a significant
22 outperformance in the last year for the
23 private equity of 27-1/2 percent, real estate
24 core up 31 percent, noncore up 29 percent,
25 infrastructure up 17 percent, and

0039

1 Proceedings
2 opportunistic fixed income up 4.6 percent. So
3 the diversification across public and private
4 markets has been powerful. And a cynic would
5 look at this and say yes, okay, I see those
6 private markets have outperformed, but they
7 are marked with a lag. They tend to be less
8 price volatile and less -- respond less to
9 economic developments in the marketplace. I
10 met with one of your private equity managers
11 yesterday and he made the statement that yes,
12 we don't have to worry about marking our
13 positions to market today because we are not
14 necessarily selling today as if we are
15 liquidating stock. We can be more selective
16 in terms of when we choose to sell a position
17 we are long. If anything as starts, things
18 can cheapen up -- and Eneasz can speak better
19 to that, but as things start to cheapen up,
20 there is a lot of dry powder in the programs
21 we have waiting to be called and put to work
22 as well.

23 And on the next slide, this is actually
24 quarter-to-date performance. We can see that
25 for the quarter we have actually outperformed

0040

1 Proceedings
2 the policy benchmark. The policy target
3 weight benchmark came in at negative 9.43
4 percent where the actual plan came in negative
5 8.9 percent, so that's 53 basis points of
6 outperformance. And that's driven by two
7 things: The allocation effect, those over and
8 underweights plus-30 basis points in that
9 small middle chart and on the right-hand side
10 investment manager outperformance alpha

11 delivered by our investment managers at
12 23-plus basis points. No one likes to see
13 negative returns, but on a relative basis,
14 that's a very fairly good outcome.
15 On the next slide, as I mentioned, John
16 is going to talk about -- more about the
17 equity market performance. This actually
18 looks at the three-month performance for
19 public markets and one-year excess performance
20 for public as well. And you can see here
21 that it's been a challenging market, perhaps
22 more so for equities. I know that John is
23 going to cover that, but fixed income has
24 pretty much performed as expected given the
25 environment that we are operating in.

0041

1 Proceedings

2 MR. LANDER: Just to make sure I
3 understand this, our U.S. equities was -- TRS
4 equities was 12 basis points below the Russell
5 3000 for the quarter?

6 MR. MEIER: Yes. Yes, that's exactly
7 right.

8 And the next slide again this shows the
9 relative, the strong outperformance associated
10 with the private market holdings for the year.
11 If you look across, you can see one year with
12 the exception of noncore real estate, it's
13 down a little bit. It's 19 points basis
14 points below its target. That index is
15 actually above and beyond what the benchmark
16 is in core by 200 basis points, so not
17 necessarily a bad result. I think the more
18 important thing to look at as long-term
19 investors is that the three-year, five-year,
20 ten-year and since-inception numbers are all
21 well above those benchmark targets and that is
22 a good outcome.

23 MR. LANDER: Our private equity
24 benchmark is Russell 3000 plus 300 basis
25 points as opposed to some private equity

0042

1 Proceedings

2 benchmark?

3 MR. MEIER: Yes, that's pretty standard.
4 It looks at the public stock market, plus an
5 illiquidity frame associated with private
6 holdings. But that -- those are the actual
7 benchmarks that are in the investment policy
8 statement.

9 Last slide -- next slide, I should say.
10 I just talked about some of the rebalancing
11 activities that we undertook in the second
12 quarter calendar year 2022. We had two

13 mid-cap managers come on and we had to fund
14 and these changes reflect that, that we raised
15 capital by selling large and mid cap and small
16 cap and reallocated it into these mid-cap
17 managers. We also had to sell some short-term
18 treasuries to fund that and then we actually
19 bought large cap again to rebalance the market
20 cap weighting across the portfolios.

21 Next, Kate. All the over and
22 underweights for the public markets are
23 basically within tolerance, within
24 expectations. It's our job -- as portfolio
25 managers and given the targets that you have

0043

1 Proceedings
2 given us in your asset allocation in the
3 investment policy statements, it's our job to
4 manage to those targets. We do so very
5 carefully looking at a couple of things. We
6 look at certainly the transaction costs
7 associated with rebalancing. The targets
8 typically have some variability of 2 to 4
9 percent depending upon the asset class around
10 them, but you can see they are all pretty
11 tight to where they are supposed to be.

12 And with that, I am going to turn it
13 over to Ed Berman who is going to do a deep
14 dive and discussion of our risk. It's going
15 to be a little different than I think you have
16 seen in the past. Ed.

17 MR. BERMAN: It's a difficult chair to
18 fill.

19 MR. MEIER: He is a difficult act to
20 follow as well. I seem to get to speak right
21 after him every time.

22 MR. BERMAN: Thank you. Excited to be
23 here. This is my first time meeting with the
24 boards and we do this as an opportunity to
25 refresh the presentation with the new visuals.

0044

1 Proceedings
2 We will go over them as we talk and first I
3 want to thank the risk team for putting
4 together the risk analysis, and specifically
5 Dan Haas is now on the line. You know him
6 very well and Dan is on standby to correct the
7 mistakes I am making probably.

8 Kate, can we look at the first slide,
9 please. So we will go over the plan in two
10 slides. We will first focus on the plan in
11 the top level and then dive into the
12 individual asset classes. So for this
13 quarter, the risks for the total risk for the
14 plans to 11.6 percent. Almost a 1 percent

15 change from the previous quarter, you can see
16 at the bottom right of this table. But what
17 does this number mean; should we worry about
18 it, should we be concerned, or is it in line
19 with expectations? So we are trying to peel
20 the onion a little bit and think what this
21 number means, what in fact this number will
22 tell us. So broadly this speaks that there
23 are two main inputs into the risk levels.
24 It's the markets and the portfolio
25 construction process.

0045

1 Proceedings

2 When we build a portfolio, the most
3 important decision we make is a stock/bond
4 split; how much we put in equity, how many --
5 how much in fixed income. The stocks always
6 bring up the highest appreciation, the best
7 chance to make returns, but they also bring us
8 the highest risk so we try to balance it with
9 the fixed income allocation which acts as a
10 balance and provides the most optimal
11 risk/return profile. So we captured this in
12 the first column on this table, which we will
13 call market portfolio. It's just a standard
14 blend of 60/40, 60 percent of MSCI ACWI which
15 is the broadest global benchmark and 40
16 percent to the Barclays U.S. Ag which is the
17 broadest measure of the U.S. fixed income.

18 The next step in the investment process
19 is the asset allocation process and this is
20 captured in Column 2, which is the policy
21 benchmark. In this exercise which is coming
22 very soon, again we split the stock portion
23 and the fixed income portion in individual
24 asset classes. And you can see at the bottom
25 of this page, that 11 buckets. And this is,

0046

1 Proceedings

2 as mentioned, captured by the second column.

3 And the final step in the investment
4 process is the actual portfolio, the plan
5 itself. And that's where we do the manager
6 selection, the intermediate rebalancing, there
7 is some cash flow needs, day-to-day management
8 of the portfolio.

9 So let's start with Column 1, market
10 portfolio and that will give us a handle or
11 feel of what markets did in the baseline for
12 our analysis. So in the market portfolio
13 there are three main dimensions of risk which
14 correspond to the three main dimensions how
15 the portfolio makes money; equities, interest
16 rate, and credit. So the equity is probably

17 most intuitive. It's captured by asset
18 allocation and it's 60 percent by
19 construction. The interest rate risk, which
20 essentially is the time value of money, is
21 measured by so-called interest rate duration.
22 So what is duration? And that's simply a
23 conveniently scaling factor that translates
24 interest rate moves into the market value
25 changes. So we can see that for this quarter,

0047

1 Proceedings

2 the interest rate durations for the market
3 portfolio is 2.6 years. It simply means that
4 1 percent increase in rate means a 2.6 percent
5 loss for the portfolio.

6 The third and last dimension of risk is
7 credit and credit represents the risk that the
8 borrowers may not repay the loans, the risk of
9 default. Much like interest rate allocation,
10 credit is measured by duration. And again
11 it's a simple scaling factor and 1 point
12 duration, 1.6 means that the 1 percent
13 increase in spread levels translates into 1.6
14 percent loss for the portfolio. You will
15 notice that the interest duration is lower
16 than credit duration. It's simply reflective
17 of the fact that Barclays Ag is mostly -- as a
18 matter of fact, about 60 percent of Barclays
19 Ag is captured by the government.

20 So what does this portfolio mean for the
21 risk levels? You can see them at the bottom
22 of this table in Column 1. So we capture here
23 two broad risk measures. First of all, total
24 risk. Total risk for the portfolio for the
25 market portfolio is 11.1 percent. What does

0048

1 Proceedings

2 this number mean? It means that over the next
3 12 months, we expect the portfolio to return
4 about 11.1 percent, within this range plus or
5 minus. And it's about a 15 percent chance
6 that it goes a little higher than 11.1 percent
7 and there is a chance it will be lower than
8 11.1 percent. If you want to see that for
9 this quarter, the risk level increased quite
10 significantly by about .9 percent. That's
11 simply a reflection of this period.

12 I will go back to Steve's portion of the
13 presentation. The equities as measured by the
14 VIX index is very high level of risk. As a
15 matter of fact, VIX is now about twice the
16 pre-COVID level. The actions are more
17 dramatic in the fixed income. So the move
18 index, which is for fixed income, is about

19 three times pre-COVID level. As a matter of
20 fact, we need to go back to the global
21 financial crisis days to see the same level of
22 risk in the fixed income markets. So it's not
23 surprising that our market portfolio risk
24 levels are impacted and that gives us a very
25 nice baseline as we move forward and assess

0049

1 Proceedings

2 these levels to the portfolio.

3 The second measure of risk you can see
4 at the bottom of this table is the beta to the
5 S&P 500. So while total risk level is
6 calibrated to longer-term performance, it's a
7 12-month return, the beta is a shorter
8 measure. To give you a sense of how much
9 shorter, it shifts with the short-term moves
10 within the S&P. And we picked the S&P 500 as
11 probably the most representative, the most
12 important equity index globally. So in the
13 entire stock markets globally, the U.S. market
14 captured about 60 percent of total
15 capitalization. And out of all U.S. equity,
16 the S&P 500 is by far the most important
17 index. So the beta of .56 means for 1 percent
18 change in the S&P, the portfolio will shift
19 .56.

20 MR. BROWN: This is for the S&P?

21 MR. BERMAN: This is for the S&P, and
22 that, of course, includes fixed income and
23 equity and everything.

24 So you will notice this number is lower
25 than the 60 percent allocation. And why this

0050

1 Proceedings

2 is so? First of all, it's because of the
3 international allocation. As the S&P moves,
4 we expect international equities to move as
5 well but not as much. But also fixed income
6 allocation, so that's where you see the
7 diversification benefits. That's exactly the
8 purpose of the diversification process and
9 that's how we expect it to be. You can see
10 also the beta is broadly unchanged, it remains
11 steady, and again it's a positive outcome.

12 Let's move to the policy benchmark.
13 That's where we adjust for the asset
14 allocation process. So what changed? First
15 of all, you will notice at the top of the
16 table that the asset allocation picked up with
17 slightly more equity risk and that's of course
18 again by construction; that's not surprising.
19 You will notice that the interest rate
20 duration, interest rate risk is slightly

21 lower. And this is simply because we take an
22 allocation to high yield, again public
23 allocation process. High yield tends to be of
24 a shorter maturity, meaning lower interest
25 rate duration. You will also notice that the

0051

1 Proceedings

2 credit spread duration is slightly lower.
3 That's because we have allocation to TIPS as
4 inflation protection and it's very relevant in
5 the current environment.

6 So what does that mean for the risk
7 levels? Moving to the bottom of the page, you
8 will see that the total risk remains almost
9 unchanged. And that's -- again, it's a
10 positive outcome. We take more equity
11 allocation, we take exposure to high yield, to
12 private markets, we take exposure across the
13 entire structure, yet the risk levels remains
14 unchanged. It's a positive; that's where we
15 see diversification at work. You will notice
16 that the beta to S&P is slightly lower, not
17 material but slightly lower. Most importantly
18 the changes to the risk level are entirely in
19 line with the changes to the market portfolio.
20 So, again, gives us confidence knowing that
21 the changes in risk level are driven by the
22 markets, not something that our manager does.
23 And, again, it's a positive outcome.

24 MR. BROWN: Yay.

25 MR. BERMAN: Finally to the plan itself,

0052

1 Proceedings

2 that's captured in the last column. There are
3 small differences. First of all, you will
4 notice the equity level is slightly different.
5 We will have more to say about it on the next
6 page. I won't spoil it, but broadly speaking
7 the rebalancing ranges. You will notice that
8 interest rate duration is slightly higher.
9 This is because of allocation to the ETI
10 program, which is exposure to long bonds so
11 it's not surprising.

12 So what does it mean for risks? You
13 will see at the bottom of the table and you
14 will notice that the risk level is slightly
15 higher, at 11.6 percent. What drove this
16 change? To some degree, it's the allocation
17 to active managers primarily outside of the
18 United States developed markets. But the most
19 important contributor is the credit markets as
20 we take material allocation to private equity,
21 infrastructure, OFI, private real estate also
22 brings high levels of risk again. We will

23 have more to say about it on the next page.
24 The beta to S&P is slightly higher, not
25 materially but you see a slight exposure to
0053

1 Proceedings
2 the S&P; it's not surprising. And here I will
3 bring forward the third measure of risk,
4 active risk. So much like as the total risk
5 level, active risk assesses the excess returns
6 for the portfolio over the benchmark. And
7 what it is is quite simply the active risk is
8 1.8 percent, meaning that the excess return
9 over the next 12 months is expected to be
10 within 1.8 percent range plus or minus. It's
11 also about a 15 percent chance that excess
12 returns will be higher and unfortunately
13 about a 15 percent chance that excess returns
14 will be lower. There is no free lunch
15 unfortunately, so it's all up and down. So
16 based on the 1.8 percent is dealing to some
17 extent by the active managers. It's the
18 private assets.

19 Again, I am deferring to the next page,
20 but before we go to the next page I want to
21 draw attention to the two charts on the right.
22 So Chart 1 shows the evolution of the risk
23 measures between these three portfolios over
24 the past 12 months. You will notice how
25 well-aligned these portfolios are; everything
0054

1 Proceedings
2 moves together. Again, gives me some comfort.
3 It's not something our managers do. Again,
4 it's a positive outcome and it means that the
5 portfolio functions as expected. You will
6 notice that all three risk measures bottomed
7 out around January of this year, January
8 December and this, again, is a function of
9 markets. As well as the volatility picked up
10 significantly in the first quarter, second
11 quarter of this year, the risk levels went up
12 but the broad relationship between the
13 benchmark and portfolio remains the same. And
14 finally the chart at the bottom of this page,
15 Chart 2, shows the evolution of active risk
16 which is the excess returns. Again, the same
17 messaging, very consistent. It bottomed out
18 at about 1.6 around December of last year and
19 has been ticking up driven by the high-risk
20 levels in the marketplace, but again the
21 relationship is steady as you would hope to
22 see for a portfolio this size and this level
23 of diversification.

24 So I will pause here if there are any

25 questions before we move to the asset class

0055

1 Proceedings

2 risks.

3 MR. LANDER: I am going to have to
4 leave. I will chime in one thing and Alison
5 will follow up on and Steve hinted at. We
6 look forward moving into the asset allocation
7 process in the near future and, you know, part
8 of what we are waiting for and kind of hoping
9 for and working for is that the governor signs
10 the basket clause bill which she indicated
11 basically all bills that were vetoed by the
12 prior governor at some point, she'll wait
13 until after the election to deal with them.
14 So I think she is going to look at them in
15 between November and December. We have
16 done -- Alison has done a really nice job of
17 rounding up a lot of folks in the investment
18 community, in the labor community, in the
19 political community to communicate there is a
20 broad consensus that giving us more
21 flexibility makes a lot of sense. That
22 doesn't mean we would automatically in the
23 asset allocation process take advantage of
24 that flexibility. That will be a decision the
25 trustees will make in consultation with our

0056

1 Proceedings

2 investment experts, but hopefully we will have
3 that and we will know for sure by the end of
4 the year. Thank you all.

5 MS. PENNY: Thank you. Have a good day.

6 MR. BERMAN: Next slide, please. Kate,
7 can we go to the next slide, please. Thank
8 you. So here we dive more into the inside of
9 the portfolio. We will consider individual
10 asset classes as defined by the strategic
11 benchmark.

12 So, first of all, let's focus on the
13 Column 1 where we review the allocations. The
14 message here is that allocations are broadly
15 in line with the benchmark. There are small
16 overweights, underweights which are primarily
17 within daily range. There is one exception
18 here at the bottom of the page, as I am sure
19 you are all aware. We are in slight
20 overweight in the private equity allocation
21 and slightly underweight in the rest of the
22 alternatives; private real estate,
23 infrastructure, and OFI.

24 In the next column, Column 2, we look at
25 the risk levels, total risk levels at the

0057

1 Proceedings
2 asset class level, and the contribution to the
3 portfolio. Actually, the same information is
4 captured in the chart in the bottom of the
5 page. A little bit easier to follow, so you
6 can track mostly the chart instead of the
7 numbers. I realize this page is a little
8 dense, a lot of numbers here, but that's just
9 unfortunately hard to avoid. Risk tends to be
10 about numbers. So focusing at the chart on
11 the bottom of the page, the blue bars
12 represent the portfolio allocations and the
13 orange bars represent the risk contribution.
14 So several takeaways from this chart. First
15 of all, there is one asset class that punches
16 well above its weight, its equities, and as a
17 matter of fact the public and private equity
18 taken together contribute about 85 percent of
19 the total risk level. This is not surprising.
20 This is actually typical for a multi-asset
21 portfolio; risk levels are much higher.
22 Within the asset allocation, the U.S. equities
23 tend to be the highest risk level and that's,
24 first of all, consistent with the highest
25 returns from the U.S. markets, but also from a

0058

1 Proceedings
2 high ratio of technology allocation within the
3 U.S. stocks. So it's not surprising.
4 Actually, the S&P 500 is one of the riskiest
5 indices among global markets. The private
6 equities are also high risk and that's
7 unfortunately the way it is; high returns mean
8 high risk. But also look at the fixed income
9 allocation in the middle of this chart.
10 Specifically core fixed income and TIPS, you
11 will notice a tall blue chart and almost no
12 orange. So fixed income provides
13 diversification; it's a balance for the
14 portfolio. It's how it's intended to be and,
15 again, it's a good outcome.

16 The next column on this page, the chart,
17 Column Number 3, active risk. Again just to
18 remind you, it's the assessment of the excess
19 returns. There is some takeaways here. First
20 of all, focusing on the public markets, active
21 risk tends to be low. For public equity it's
22 about 1 percent and for fixed income it's
23 less. Again, that's not surprising; it's by
24 construction. But there are some areas of
25 risk concentration. In particular if you

0059

1 Proceedings
2 focus on the developed markets ex-U.S, you

3 will notice that the active risk is almost 3
4 percent and this is a reflection of the active
5 nature of our managers. Bailie Gifford I
6 won't draw as much, as John will cover a lot
7 of it in more details and the same goes for
8 emerging markets. But within fixed income,
9 you will see that the active risks are low and
10 that's simply a reflection of the mostly
11 passive nature of our fixed income allocation.
12 It's as expected and in line with the
13 portfolio construction process. The numbers
14 get to be much larger on the bottom of the
15 page. That's where we get into private
16 equities, and I hope it doesn't come as a
17 surprise. We benchmark private equities
18 against public markets. We know they perform
19 very differently. We expect excess returns
20 from private markets to be different and
21 that's reflected in our risk numbers, so
22 that's not surprising.

23 It's probably more interesting is
24 comparing risk against returns because I keep
25 mentioning that risk is a measure of return,

0060

1 Proceedings
2 right, and that's what's captured in Column 4.
3 I'm sorry. The first thing that jumps out at
4 me in Column 4 is the sea of red in the public
5 markets. And I want to connect it to Steve's
6 portion of the presentation as we just heard.
7 This was probably the most challenging period
8 for the 60/40. We need to go back about a
9 hundred years to see similar performance. All
10 this portfolio is not constructed for this
11 quarter. We are more long-term investors so
12 it's not surprising it was a challenge in this
13 quarter as Steve just mentioned, but it's
14 interesting to see how well it compares
15 against our risk measures and by five years
16 it's actually not surprising. For the U.S.
17 equity allocation, the returns were well
18 within expectation. For the developed markets
19 ex-U.S, the returns were much worse than
20 expectations. Again, go back to what I said
21 before about 15 percent chance that the
22 returns will be worse. We are definitely
23 within this range. This is a unique
24 historical period and the returns for
25 developed market ex-U.S, Bailie Gifford comes

0061

1 Proceedings
2 to mind, were unfortunately disappointing.
3 The same can be said about fixed income where
4 the treasury markets, again quoting back from

5 Steve, you have to go back to the 18th century
6 to find a comparable period. So it's not
7 surprising that the returns for the fixed
8 income allocation were worse than expected.
9 At the same time, the excess returns actually
10 performed well and it conformed to our model.
11 You see that the excess returns were well
12 within our estimates. So what it tells us is
13 that the managers performed as we wanted them
14 to perform. Investments performed as
15 expected, but we are at the mercy of the
16 markets. Private markets provide a very
17 useful diversification and that's at the
18 bottom of the page. There is one exception.
19 It's a good exception; private real estate.
20 It performed well and above much of our
21 estimates. I hope it will continue, but the
22 rest of the asset classes performed as our
23 model estimate.

24 So I will pause here if there are any
25 questions before we move towards

0062

1 Proceedings
2 forward-looking projections.
3 MS. PENNY: Any questions?
4 MR. BROWN: I am still shocked we have
5 records back to 1788.
6 MR. BERMAN: Yes, but it's clearly a
7 sign of the times.
8 MR. BUCKLEY: The blue sheet on the
9 total risk contribution column, what is that
10 intended to imply across the various asset
11 classes and sub-asset classes? I am just
12 noticing we got emerging market 11.9
13 contribution total risk. I assume that whole
14 column is intended to sum to 100. The
15 conditional formatting between the 11.9 and
16 say the 0.8 for the TIPS for example, I just
17 wanted to better understand what that column
18 is intending to convey.
19 MR. BERMAN: The conditional formatting,
20 it identifies the asset classes in each group
21 which provides the highest and lowest
22 allocation.
23 MR. BUCKLEY: So just max and min.
24 MR. BERMAN: So it's within each bucket
25 within equities, within fixed income.

0063

1 Proceedings
2 MR. BUCKLEY: Okay, great. Thank you.
3 MR. BERMAN: I would say there is no
4 huge discoveries here, not to say there were
5 none. There were no huge discoveries; there
6 were no huge takeaways. I would hate to bring

7 this to the table, but if there were, we, of
8 course, would have communicated it long before
9 this meeting.

10 MR. MEIER: I appreciate some of the
11 concepts Ed has been going through. I think
12 he is doing a great job presenting them, but
13 they are complex. I have been doing this for
14 38 years. I am a certified financial risk
15 manager, and the first time I went through it
16 with Ed, my head was spinning a little bit,
17 but it's the third time for me and actually
18 when it sinks in, it's really very, very
19 informative. And I hope it ties into the
20 portfolio review that we did earlier as well,
21 but we had to recruit someone with a Ph.D. in
22 organic chemistry to manage the risk for your
23 portfolio.

24 MR. BERMAN: I am not sure it's that
25 important, but yes.

0064

1 Proceedings

2 MR. MEIER: In a good way.

3 MR. BERMAN: Risk is mostly
4 multidimensional, it's complex. We are more
5 than happy to work with Steve, maybe too much.
6 I am more than happy to answer questions and
7 provide color on that. There is significantly
8 more to be said.

9 Can we please turn to the next slide.
10 So here we are looking at the forward-looking
11 projections as has been the custom. And I
12 think the purpose of this is to highlight some
13 possible evolutions for the markets going
14 forward, but primarily to think about the
15 asset allocation and to see how the portfolio
16 may perform in different environments. And I
17 think it's as Steve says several times a day,
18 we have no crystal ball which we don't and I
19 would say this part in particular is very
20 difficult for projections. I have to say that
21 our conviction level is not very high and it's
22 probably easy to draw thousands of scenarios;
23 it's more difficult to pinpoint more likely
24 scenarios. So I am not assigning any
25 probabilities, but this is a reflection of how

0065

1 Proceedings

2 we see the world and how we see the future
3 evolution.

4 So for the base-case scenario which I
5 would say is medium level of conviction for
6 us, we see a softish landing for the U.S.
7 economy and I would say it's -- the time is
8 probably around six months. I think it will

9 deteriorate if we project it further than
10 that, but we see the Federal Reserve
11 moderately successful in guiding the U.S.
12 economy to a soft landing. The stock market
13 probably has a little bit more downside. The
14 rates remain elevated, but probably more so in
15 the curve. But the inflation will probably
16 moderate as supply lines get streamlined, but
17 the credit spread also remain elevated and
18 slightly widened and that's driven by the
19 headwinds facing the companies in terms of
20 high interest rates and just the ability to
21 generate profits and the commodity prices will
22 moderate slightly given a slowdown in the
23 economy and the supply lines.

24 The negative surprise is probably a
25 growing conviction at this point especially

0066

1 Proceedings

2 given the recent Powell speech in Jackson
3 Hole, and that's why we see the stock market
4 taking probably a deeper downside. So
5 average, probably minus 15 percent. We see
6 the rates remaining elevated, moving higher.
7 The curve is inverted further. Inflation
8 unfortunately is still a big concern and
9 potentially moving higher and the credit
10 spreads, of course, widen driven by headwind
11 space globally. Of course connected to the
12 inflation, commodity prices remain high and
13 even higher. So what will be maybe a catalyst
14 for the negative surprise? Well, first of
15 all, it's the Federal Reserve overtightening
16 and with the unique scenario the Federal
17 Reserve may be tightening in a slowed economy,
18 that's not a positive environment. Ongoing
19 war in Europe may have an impact specifically
20 on the Western Europe. Germany comes to mind,
21 but also France, Italy, and other countries.
22 And we are watching carefully the situation in
23 China. The Chinese economy, again as Steve
24 mentioned, has been a driver of global
25 expansion up until COVID. It's been

0067

1 Proceedings

2 performing fairly poorly recently. It's in
3 the restructuring phase now.
4 And, finally, there is always a chance
5 for a positive surprise even though our
6 conviction is very low. And I would say the
7 best driver at this point of a positive
8 surprise is more on the policy side. I think
9 it's a question of stimulus. So Germany just
10 announced recently the fiscal stimulus and its

11 restructuring of the energy market capturing
12 energy prices. There's a possibility for
13 domestic stimulus. And in China watching the
14 commerce, there is a chance there will be a
15 stimulus in China as well. So in this case,
16 markets may respond positively. You can see
17 an upside in the U.S. S&P 500. The curve will
18 probably steepen to be more normal and front
19 end will move slightly down and the back end
20 will move higher. Inflation will moderate and
21 the credit spreads will tighten.

22 So what does it mean for the portfolio?
23 The results are shown in the two charts at the
24 bottom. So first of all, focusing on the
25 Chart 1 which shows the evolution at the

0068

1 Proceedings
2 portfolio level, there are several interesting
3 takeaways. First of all, the direction of
4 travel is not surprising. I mean, we
5 understand when the stock market tanks we will
6 probably face some losses, but the magnitude
7 is interesting. So let's focus, first of all,
8 on the gray bar which shows the base-case
9 scenario. And the base case will project the
10 stock market decline by about minus 5 percent.
11 Notice that the portfolio is declining by
12 minus 3.8 percent. That's a big change. So
13 we are capturing almost 80 percent of the
14 equity markets. It's more than what would be
15 applied by 60 percent allocation. And why
16 that is so? You can see in the chart on the
17 right the asset classes, the gray bars, they
18 all point down. There is no diversification.
19 Under this scenario, all asset classes perform
20 poorly. The TIPS detract, the core fixed
21 income detracts. As a matter of fact, you
22 will notice that the core fixed income is the
23 only asset class that detracts under any of
24 these risk scenarios.

25 Focusing on the positive surprise again,

0069

1 Proceedings
2 it performs worse than expected. For a 10
3 percent upwards in equities, the portfolio
4 returns only plus 4.6 returns while not
5 capturing the full size of the upside. Less
6 than 60 percent is supplied by the equity
7 market. Again focusing on the green bars on
8 the chart on the right, you see the TIPS
9 detracting. The only scenario that performs
10 sort of as expected is the negative surprise;
11 it performs in line with the allocation. So
12 the technical term for this behavior is

13 negative conductivity. It's not what you want
14 to see from the asset allocation and, broadly
15 speaking, the reason for that is a fairly
16 unique economic environment. We are long-term
17 investors. The asset allocation is calibrated
18 to long term. The current environment is
19 anything but long term. The technical term,
20 it's a black swan event. It's an outlier.
21 Again, no crystal ball. These are just
22 three possible scenarios. We cannot even
23 assign probabilities for these scenarios. We
24 are facing probably almost an infinite
25 possible range of outcomes, but we thought

0070

1 Proceedings
2 that it's an interesting exercise to highlight
3 certain features of the portfolio.
4 So I will pause there for any questions
5 and discussion.
6 MS. PENNY: Any questions for Ed? Okay,
7 we can get rid of the negatives. I have to
8 ask when it's Mike's turn, you are going to
9 have much better news for us so no pressure.
10 MR. FULVIO: It's all positive
11 surprises.
12 MS. PENNY: Thank you so much.
13 MR. BERMAN: Thank you.
14 MS. PENNY: Okay, so the website?
15 MS. HIRSH: So I will introduce this and
16 hand it over to Kate Visconti on our team in
17 BAM. Many of you have seen Kate on Zoom as
18 the person who is really running slides and
19 whatnot. She is -- also she joined the team
20 in February as assistant director of pensions
21 and has been helping just generally project
22 manager and working with things across BAM and
23 outside of BAM and workers' rights issues.
24 One of the things she spearheaded is an
25 attempt to make our investments more

0071

1 Proceedings
2 accessible.
3 So I for one when I became a trustee in
4 January, I looked at the monthly reports that
5 we get from State Street that we upload to
6 Convene. I don't understand anything in them,
7 I can't look at them and figure out how much
8 money we have at any given place. I know
9 based on questions that we got from our
10 trustees, I am not the only one who has a hard
11 time reading those reports. I think Steve
12 told me it was a hard report to understand, so
13 one of the things we wanted to do was give
14 trustees and really the general public -- this

15 is all public information already -- the
16 ability to understand where we are invested
17 and how in a public-facing way.
18 So Kate is going to walk you through the
19 changes we are making to the asset allocation
20 tab on the Comptroller's website, what we are
21 recommending. And once we get through the
22 series of September board meetings, we will
23 make this live on the Comptroller's website
24 open to any feedback and questions, et cetera
25 as we go through that.

0072

1 Proceedings

2 So with that, Kate, I hand it over to
3 you.

4 MR. RAY: Alison, I will say in that
5 monthly report there is one useful table in
6 that that's not anywhere else; page 12.

7 MS. HIRSH: Okay, I will focus on page
8 12. Okay, Kate.

9 MS. PENNY: We heard your name for so
10 long, it's nice to hear from you.

11 MS. VISCONTI: You too, likewise. So
12 thank you, Alison. Thank you for your time on
13 this.

14 I am going to take maybe five minutes to
15 give you an overview of this new tool and I
16 will walk you through a few examples how we
17 think you might want to use it. So keep in
18 mind as I am going through it that all the
19 data presented here is data that is already
20 provided to you in the monthly and quarterly
21 reports and also already on our website in PDF
22 form, but as we were just saying it's a little
23 bit clunky so this is hopefully going to
24 streamline things for you.

25 So looking at this dashboard as it is

0073

1 Proceedings

2 right now, you are seeing assets under
3 management across all the five systems. So
4 let's hone in on yours. You can do that by
5 clicking here. You can also use these filters
6 up here, so this is how would you filter for
7 Teachers. So now you are looking at a
8 dashboard of assets under management for
9 Teachers specifically. Over here in the top
10 left you are seeing total net asset value for
11 your system as of June 2022, the end of June.
12 Over here you are seeing net asset value, but
13 it's broken down by asset class. So private
14 equity, 7 billion. 7.7, so its units are in
15 million. Down here in the bottom left corner
16 you are seeing that same information, but you

17 are seeing it visually. You can see what a
18 large percentage public equity is, for
19 example. And then down here in the bottom
20 right, you see what we think might be the most
21 useful part of this new tool. So this is a
22 list of all of the investments that you have
23 with their corresponding asset class and their
24 corresponding net asset value.

25 So let's walk through an example. Let's
0074

1 Proceedings
2 say that you are interested in seeing your
3 investments in private equity. So you can see
4 again, click anywhere else, that says private
5 equity or you can filter up here at the top.
6 Now, what you are looking at is a dashboard of
7 your system and specifically your system's
8 investments in private equity. So you are
9 saying that you have a total of 7.8 billion in
10 private equity and then you are seeing down
11 here in the bottom right all of these private
12 equity investments.

13 So, for example, EQT Fund VIII you are
14 seeing has 118 million in that asset value.
15 So let's say you are interested in
16 understanding your fund with EQT more broadly
17 but you know that you have EQT outside of
18 private equity, so what you might do is remove
19 this filter here. Now you are looking down at
20 your whole system. Go over here to investment
21 name. You can type EQT and now here you are
22 seeing all of your investments in EQT. And as
23 you select these, the dashboard populates with
24 basically a view of your EQT investments. So
25 you are seeing that you have 512 million in

0075

1 Proceedings
2 EQT. You are seeing the breakdown across
3 infrastructure and private equity down here.
4 You are seeing the proportions, so it's
5 actually almost even for your system. And
6 over here you are seeing the investments
7 themselves so you are seeing all of the
8 individual EQT investments in infrastructure,
9 and then down here all of the individual EQT
10 investments in private equity and their
11 corresponding net asset value.

12 So maybe the reason that you are
13 interested in this is because a member wanted
14 to know this information for whatever reason.
15 You can go ahead, click this button here. You
16 see export data and then you can download it.
17 You can receive it as an Excel spreadsheet and
18 do with it whatever you would like. You can

19 do that with any iteration of the tool in a
20 different section.
21 So this is the assets under management
22 side. We also have a new tab which is going
23 to be asset performance. So over here, as it
24 loads over here in the top left you are seeing
25 something that we already have on the website.

0076

1 Proceedings

2 You might be familiar really just one bar at
3 the bottom of this chart that's on the
4 existing website, so now it's a little bit
5 more interactive. This is the fiscal year to
6 date for all the systems. You can click on
7 yours and make it a little bit clearer. And
8 this is right now showing as of the fiscal
9 year end, June 2022. You can select any month
10 and you will see fiscal year to date up until
11 the end of that month.

12 So turning to the other two, this chart
13 here and the corresponding graphs below over
14 here, you are seeing the year-over-year
15 performance for your system. This is for your
16 total portfolio. You can go in, and let's say
17 you are interested in infrastructure. Filter
18 and you will see the performance year over
19 year for every infrastructure and you can see
20 down here a chart that will show that same
21 corresponding information visually.

22 So this is a broad overview of the tool.
23 We hope that it's going to be helpful to you,
24 helpful to your members. Like Alison said,
25 it's your data, it's your information, so your

0077

1 Proceedings

2 feedback is really critical and helpful. So
3 do you have any questions?

4 MS. PENNY: Thank you. It is great.
5 But, Kate, did you want to just tell the
6 members again: So first when does it become
7 live and how would they get to this, and this
8 is for all of the members, any member of the
9 public can go on the website? You want to
10 just tell them the website they would go on.

11 MS. VISCONTI: We can send this. Thank
12 you. It's still in development mode, so it's
13 a little bit hard. This is not the right
14 website link. Let's see. I can show you
15 where it is now. If you can see, still see my
16 screen, so this is the regular Comptroller's
17 Office website. You would go -- this is the
18 best way I know how to do it at least. Go
19 over overview of the office, down to this is
20 how you get to really the pension side and BAM

21 side, and then here you have the asset
22 allocation page. So this is -- maybe this is
23 helpful. This is what it looks like right
24 now. You basically have for all the systems
25 the total assets under management and then the

0078

1 Proceedings
2 breakdown broadly by asset class. And then
3 this is that same information. This is the
4 sum total what we have right now and it's on
5 the Comptroller's Office website right here.
6 We can make sure you have that link handy, but
7 this will be replaced. Yes.

8 MS. HIRSH: Just to answer the second
9 question: We want to present it to each of
10 the boards. So the last investment meeting is
11 the last week of September, so the plan is to
12 go live around October 1st following the last
13 board.

14 MS. PENNY: That's great improvements.
15 Does anyone want to add anything to Kate or --
16 you did a great job.

17 MR. RAY: I have a question for Kate.
18 The AUM, is that in realtime; how often is it
19 updated? Because there are always calls and
20 distributions.

21 MS. VISCONTI: It's a good question
22 because we have some nuance. Maybe if we have
23 Dan on here, he can jump in and provide the
24 nuance that I can't provide. But it's updated
25 within 60 days of month end and sometimes it's

0079

1 Proceedings
2 happening sooner. So this data is coming from
3 State Street and basically as soon as they
4 have it, it gets posted. So the latest we
5 have here is July 2022, but maybe if we -- do
6 we have Dan on? He is probably -- Dan, do you
7 want to jump in and provide that nuance that
8 we are talking about? We can't hear you. At
9 least, I can't.

10 MR. HAAS: I was on mute. My apologies.

11 Good morning, everyone. Kate, I think
12 you nailed it. If I understand the process
13 correctly -- and I am kind of new to the
14 nuances of this tool, but we should be picking
15 up audited State Street monthly numbers which
16 are typically posted I think 18 business days
17 out from month end. A little processing time
18 I think on our end, but you would typically
19 see these -- what's called a five-week lag.
20 They are accounting values. They are as of
21 prior month end, so they would include any
22 valuations that State Street recorded that

23 month. And then the net asset values you see
24 are the most recent valuation for a private
25 equity manager, for instance, that have been

0080

1 Proceedings
2 adjusted for cash flows. So it's an important
3 nuance to note because when Eneasz, for
4 instance, gives you a deep dive or actually
5 any of our alternative assets group heads give
6 you a summary, you will see that that
7 information is official as of the prior
8 quarter end. So there is a timing difference
9 in what you will see posted up here. I am
10 dragging you back in the weeds as always, but
11 happy to answer any other questions you have.

12 MR. RAY: So it's as recent as the most
13 recent State Street report?

14 MR. HAAS: That's correct.

15 MS. VISCONTI: Yes. So nothing will go
16 up here before it goes to you.

17 Any other questions or feedback? If you
18 think of anything, you can send it my way or
19 Alison whenever it comes to you.

20 MS. PENNY: Thank you, Kate.

21 MS. VISCONTI: All right, Alison, back
22 to you.

23 MS. PENNY: Well, I think -- Yaffa,
24 welcome back and I am sure your fingers need
25 some exercise. Yaffa is our amazing

0081

1 Proceedings
2 stenographer.
3 So, Mike, I know you are just itching to
4 start. Should we take a ten-minute break if
5 that's okay, because it's been over
6 two-and-a-half hours. But we will take a
7 ten-minute break and come back.

8 (Recess taken.)

9 MS. PENNY: All right, welcome back.
10 And we are now -- we are still in public
11 session and it's time for public funds and we
12 are turning it over to Mike Fulvio.

13 MR. FULVIO: I will start out. Great to
14 see you all. We will begin, we call it the
15 second quarterly report although I will focus
16 in on the numbers to end the fiscal year which
17 ended June 30th. So if you are following
18 along in the materials on Convene, I am in
19 page 23 of the quarterly report and you can
20 see here what's otherwise the monthly report
21 for the plan. The Passport Funds at the end
22 of June 30th, the Diversified Equity Fund
23 finished with about 15.2 billion in assets.
24 Again given the challenges we discussed

25 earlier with respect to markets in the first
0082

1 Proceedings

2 half of the 2022 calendar year, having a
3 notable impact on performance of these funds
4 which as you know are largely equity-oriented.
5 The Diversified Equity Fund returned negative
6 21.7 percent for the fiscal year. The numbers
7 for July are better. And then if we are
8 looking through the underlying composites, you
9 know, a similar dynamic with respect to
10 actively-managed equity strategies here in
11 this fund as well. It was a challenging
12 environment for active managers in the first
13 half of this year and that shows up in the
14 relative results for the actively-managed U.S.
15 composite. The non-U.S. equity composite here
16 has active managers did keep up with the
17 benchmarks all told for the fiscal year. That
18 composite was down about 20.3 percent. The
19 Balanced Fund which ended fiscal year with
20 about 539 million in assets, that was down
21 about 1.9 percent last year roughly in line
22 with the benchmark. The International Equity
23 Fund, I noted earlier the active composite,
24 the Diversified Equity Fund which again is a
25 mirror of the International Equity Fund, that

0083

1 Proceedings

2 fund down 20.7 percent. The Sustainable
3 Equity Fund last year doing comparatively
4 better to the International Equity Fund was
5 down 18.8 percent. That fund was roughly in
6 line with its Russell 1000 growth benchmark.
7 And, again, the U.S. Equity Index Fund
8 following the markets there down about 13
9 percent and the International Equity Index
10 Fund down about 18 percent. Obviously as we
11 discussed in the past, the capital flows into
12 and out of those funds impacting performance
13 and time-weighted results.

14 So I will pause there and see if there
15 are any questions on the fiscal year results.

16 MS. PENNY: Any questions for Mike?

17 MR. KAZANSKY: No.

18 MR. FULVIO: I will note, because it's
19 in the material, we have been discussing
20 active management. And we have the
21 performance scorecard, if you will. We did
22 meet recently with the U.S. equity managers on
23 the active management side for the Diversified
24 Equity Fund. No material updates there. As
25 far as on the International Equity side, there

0084

1 Proceedings
2 are a couple of new flags triggered. We are
3 expected to meet with those managers this
4 fall.
5 I am now going to switch over to the
6 Passport Funds monthly report for July, which
7 as we have been discussing has a nicer bend to
8 it. The Diversified Equity Fund started the
9 fiscal year quite strongly as did markets.
10 That fund was up about 8 percent during the
11 month of July, roughly in line with both of
12 its custom benchmarks. The actively-managed
13 equity composite, we saw that outperform. We
14 also saw very modest outperformance from the
15 International Equity composite. What we have
16 seen in the first half of the 2022 calendar
17 year was a reversal of what we have been
18 talking about for many years where growth has
19 been outpacing value. Value made its
20 resurgence in the first half of this year. We
21 actually saw that quickly revert back in July
22 for the month and since then, it's reverted
23 again. August was another strong month for
24 value, but again managers keeping up in what
25 was a strong month of July. The Balanced Fund

0085

1 Proceedings
2 was up about 2.9 percent. International
3 Equities up over 4 percent for the
4 International Equity Fund. The Sustainable
5 Equity Fund was up almost 13 percent for the
6 month of July. Again, speaking to the
7 strength of the growth stocks during July and
8 then you can see the two index funds roughly
9 tracking their benchmark, the U.S. up about
10 9.3 percent and the International Equity Index
11 up about 3.7.

12 So I will pause there. Otherwise, we
13 will just very briefly touch upon August.

14 MR. ALEXANDER: We can skip August. We
15 can skip August. I think Steven had a very
16 comprehensive presentation that covered a lot
17 of not-so-great news for August, but on the
18 high level for the month of August, we
19 actually had negative results across the board
20 for both.

21 MS. PENNY: Devon, what did I tell you?

22 MR. ALEXANDER: For both equity and
23 fixed income although on the positive side,
24 fiscal year to date still positive.

25 So I would actually just end it there

0086

1 Proceedings
2 and pause for any questions, but the details

3 are there.

4 MR. RAY: The one-year column is
5 startling.

6 MR. FULVIO: Yes. I want to leave some
7 time; we have MFS coming in to speak. As we
8 do periodically bring in one of the managers
9 that you work with, a working relationship
10 with MFS, they are here to present their
11 capital markets views and I guess I will bring
12 them in now. They have three folks. I will
13 sit here. Do you mind if we will put them in
14 here if that's okay, if we shift them over.

15 (Discussion off the record.)

16 MS. STANG: Why don't you start by
17 introducing yourself to the stenographer on
18 the screen just so she can get your name, and
19 if there is any complication to your name
20 spelling that would be --

21 MS. HAIGH: So I am Stacey Haigh. I am
22 your dedicated relationship manager. Joining
23 me are my colleagues, Rob Almeida who is our
24 global investment strategist, and Kelley Rullo
25 who partners with me on our institutional

0087

1 Proceedings
2 relationships on the East Coast.

3 MR. FULVIO: Feel free to tell me which
4 slides.

5 MS. HAIGH: So thank you so much for
6 inviting us here today and thank you for your
7 nine-year partnership with us and the trust
8 and confidence that you have had with us in
9 the past nine years in managing assets on
10 behalf of the Teachers' Retirement System. We
11 are honored to be a part of your mission and
12 investing in the retirement for the New York
13 City educators and their families, so thank
14 you very much. So with that, maybe I will
15 hand it over to Kelley and then move on to
16 Rob.

17 MS. RULLO: Thank you again for your
18 time. My name is Kelley Rullo. We are
19 thrilled here -- to be here today with our
20 colleague, Rob Almeida. Rob is a member of
21 our investment management team. He has been
22 at the firm for over 20 years. He is one of
23 our multi-asset portfolio managers and as
24 global investment strategists at MFS, he is a
25 frequent presenter of perspectives from across

0088

1 Proceedings
2 our global research platform to our
3 institutional relationships. In our time
4 today we are going to have Rob share some of

5 those perspectives from our platform and
6 really focus in on what our efforts are
7 looking at and what we believe is material for
8 long-term investors and asset allocators such
9 as yourselves.

10 So with that, maybe I will kick things
11 over to Rob. We will have time at the end for
12 questions, but certainly welcome and encourage
13 open dialogue. So if you have any questions,
14 feel free to jump in at any point.

15 MR. ALMEIDA: Thank you all very much
16 for your partnership and for your time today.
17 As Stacey and Kelley referenced, my name is
18 Rob Almeida. I work inside the investment
19 department. I have a dual role. I serve as a
20 portfolio manager on a couple of strategies
21 and serve as the firm's investment strategist.

22 I work, just for context, maybe a little
23 bit differently from other asset managers,
24 strategists, or Wall Street strategists that
25 you might be familiar with. All of those,

0089

1 Proceedings

2 most all perhaps very smart men and women
3 operate from what I call an outside-in
4 perspective where they have mental framework
5 for what drives financial assets; might be an
6 economic view, it might be a financial metric
7 view. Whatever it is, they utilize that to
8 construct a view and then that view is
9 espoused internally to other investors and
10 they share that externally. I do the
11 opposite; I work inside out. So it's my job
12 the way I see it not to give you my view or my
13 team's view, it's to give you MFS' view.

14 So what I do is I sit across the global
15 research platform in our fixed income
16 meetings, in our equity meetings, in our
17 aggregated fixed income and equity meetings,
18 U.S. equity, non-U.S. equity, large cap, small
19 cap, across the board and I try to aggregate
20 what I am seeing and hearing across the
21 organization and I use that to invest in my
22 strategy and give you what is hopefully a very
23 short, very concise, very honest view of how
24 we are thinking about the world and just do it
25 in 12, 13 minutes.

0090

1 Proceedings

2 Maybe back up a couple of slides. Go
3 backwards to the front. One more. Go one
4 more. Right to the beginning. So my title is
5 very boring, Financial Market Outlook. So it
6 is what it says, but my theme is focusing on

7 what matters. And I don't know if this
8 analogy will resonate as you are educators,
9 but I have an 18-year-old son who is entering
10 his senior year in high school and of course
11 doesn't listen to anything that I have to say.
12 But as my wife and I just try to message with
13 him as he is preparing for his post-high
14 school education on college and working on his
15 essay and all sorts of things, what matters?
16 What's really, really -- because there is so
17 much to be anxious about and worry about, so
18 let's just focus on what matters.

19 And similarly with financial markets,
20 you know, what we have seen over the last 20
21 years thanks to the Internet is a systematic
22 democratization of information. And as
23 educators, I think you will appreciate
24 information and knowledge are two different
25 things; they are not the same thing. We might

0091

1 Proceedings
2 be more informed, but it doesn't mean we are
3 more knowledgeable as it pertains to financial
4 markets. Now performance for the equity
5 markets, it used to be on the evening news.
6 Now you are getting it on your phone
7 instantaneously. Jerome Powell sneezed or
8 caught a cold or said something, that's news,
9 that's moving markets. It's not material;
10 it's not important.

11 If we simplify, what's the purpose of
12 financial markets? Every industry has a
13 purpose. What's the value proposition to
14 society? The purpose of financial markets is
15 to allocate scarce resources to society.
16 Three hundred years ago, kings and queens
17 allocated to society scarce capital.
18 Beginning with capitalism, market participants
19 determined the cost of capital, the price of
20 capital, and who got what and how much. So
21 what's happened in the last few years we have
22 conflated things, things like that on
23 television; GDP, unemployment, inflation.
24 These things matter and we will talk about
25 them, I am not dismissing them, but do they

0092

1 Proceedings
2 matter nearly as much as we think? Is that
3 really what's important to your pensioners and
4 your investors?

5 So with that, Mike, jump two slides.
6 Perfect. So how I constructed my very short
7 presentation, I guess I want to maybe back up
8 my claim that what matters is cash flows.

9 It's profits that drive asset prices. If we
10 think about it in really simple terms whether
11 it's treasury bonds, New York General
12 Obligation bonds, Salesforce.com equity, IBM
13 equity, every financial asset in the world is
14 a stock of wealth. It's a representation of
15 the potential cash flow generation of that
16 asset it represents. What we are looking at
17 here, the gray line is probably one of the
18 most talked about things in financial markets;
19 that's GDP, that's global GDP.

20 What I did is I started out at 100
21 coming out of the global financial crisis and
22 you can see what global growth did for the
23 next business cycle, right? I am showing you
24 what you already know. That's not the point,
25 though. The point is the blue line. The blue

0093

1 Proceedings
2 line is wealth. That's what I am using here
3 is profits, global corporate profits, and you
4 can see what global corporate profits did.
5 Again, I indexed it at 100 and over the course
6 of the last business cycle. So from the end
7 of the global financial crisis up until COVID,
8 the lockdowns hit in February 2020, very long
9 but very weak growth business cycle. Equity
10 markets up -- were up 250 percent worldwide.
11 Investments are simple; cash flows drive asset
12 prices. It's really hard because the future
13 has no facts, not a single one.

14 The point I am trying to make, you can
15 see up until 2020 what did that line do. It
16 was up 260, 270; that's what drives asset
17 price. The gray line, GDP, that's a flow.
18 It's just a flow; it's just a year-on-year
19 number. It's representative of people
20 spending money, going to a New York Rangers
21 game, buying milk, buying a car. That's the
22 bulk of it, that's two-thirds and the rest is
23 government spending, companies spending money.
24 So it's two different things, but we conflate
25 the two.

0094

1 Proceedings
2 Mike, go to the next slide please. This
3 is probably the most important one. So this
4 is looking at profits through a slightly
5 different lens. This is profit margins and
6 this is really what's most important. So the
7 blue line -- I guess they are both blue, but
8 the dark blue line is S&P 500 so companies in
9 the United States. The light blue line is
10 outside the United States, so companies inside

11 the MSCI EAFE Index. Now the dotted line
12 going left to right, that's average which as
13 educators you know you are never really at the
14 average. It's just a marking point; you are
15 either above it or below it. But the point
16 being that over the last 20 years, profit
17 margins in the United States and outside of
18 the United States beginning in 2008, 2009
19 after the recession accelerated just like in
20 the prior slide that I showed you. What
21 matters for future asset prices, what matters
22 for future equity market performance is which
23 way these lines will go. That's it;
24 everything else is an input. So central banks
25 setting interest rates, that's the cost of

0095

1 Proceedings

2 capital. Regulation growth in the economy,
3 those things matter, but they are inputs into
4 the single output that matters most which is
5 profit margins.

6 And I guess what I want to share with
7 you and what we are constructively concerned
8 about, maybe that's an oxymoron phrase, is
9 your average profit margin in the United
10 States is around 9 percent. It's been that
11 way for 100 years. I am just showing you 20
12 years because I wanted to show a non-U.S.
13 universe. And you can see about a year, year
14 and a half before the COVID virus, margins
15 started to fall. Now, profits are just a
16 function of revenues and cost. So how many
17 cups of coffee is Starbucks going to sell
18 tomorrow multiplied by the price of those
19 cups of coffee minus the cost of making and
20 selling coffee; it's very, very simple.

21 So the question investors should have
22 been asking throughout the 2010 year is in an
23 environment where the economic growth is so
24 weak, there is no inflation, how are profits
25 so high? And if we just take a simple

0096

1 Proceedings

2 Sherlock Holmes methodology, remove all
3 possibilities, the one left standing is the
4 answer: It wasn't coming from economic growth,
5 it wasn't coming from selling widgets or
6 raising the prices on widgets; it was coming
7 from countries shifting labor outside of the
8 country. Offshoring, it was elongating supply
9 chains, it was borrowing money. All these
10 things are reversing now, so here we are and
11 profit margins were at an all-time high
12 pre-COVID and they blew through that. I think

13 the simplest explanation is this was a sugar
14 high.

15 Now what's happening? The reverse.
16 What's the price tag for the sugar high?
17 Well, now unfortunately some people can't
18 afford -- one in out of six households are
19 behind in their utility needs, so we know the
20 cost of it. And what we believe we are going
21 to see is as growth continues to fade --
22 that's a nice word for slowdown. As revenues
23 fade, slow down, that stimulus fades, wears
24 off, as interest rates go up, what we are
25 going to start to see is those lines fall.

0097

1 Proceedings

2 That's one half of the equation. The other
3 half of the equation is now the cost of
4 managing, running your business, undergoing
5 what we think is a step-function structural
6 change. I will highlight in a minute why.
7 So go to the next slide. So what
8 matters is cash flow. The second thing that
9 matters is what's the price of those cash
10 flows valuation. For long-term investors like
11 you folks, it's not all that important. You
12 have got 10, 20, 30-year horizon so the price
13 you are paying today looking out over 20
14 years, it's a lot less material. But since we
15 are talking about near-term market, it
16 matters. So you are probably wondering well,
17 this isn't a valuation slide; what am I
18 looking at? So everyone is aware of the
19 massive amount of borrowing that governments
20 made around the world to, let's say,
21 accelerate out of the pandemic. The numbers
22 are so big it's just hard to even
23 contextualize, so I am showing it as a
24 percentage of the economy.

25 So to put it into context, the left-hand

0098

1 Proceedings

2 axis is the Federal Reserve balance sheet as a
3 percentage of GDP. That's that blue line.
4 And for 100 years -- I am only showing you the
5 last 20 -- it's only been about 4 or 5
6 percent. The gray line is the European
7 Central Bank's balance sheet; that's a
8 percentage of their economy. That's on the
9 right-hand axis. That's been a little bit
10 higher, but around 8, 9, 10 percent. Both
11 took a step-function jump up during the global
12 financial crisis. You can see that there in
13 '08 and of course we see what it did over the
14 2010s in quantitative easing, then took a

15 massive spike in the last two years.
16 Go back to my earlier comments, the
17 purpose of the financial markets. It's priced
18 society's scarce resources and allocated them.
19 And what I am trying to demonstrate here is
20 the cost or the potential implications of
21 stimulus. So at 40 percent of GDP or in
22 Europe at 70 percent of GDP, what's happened
23 is markets aren't pricing risk; central
24 bankers are. They made financial markets
25 wildly inefficient.

0099

1 Proceedings

2 If we can go to the next slide, I will
3 give you one last proof point. So this is
4 looking at U.S. small companies. I am using
5 the Russell 2000 and Russell 3000. And what
6 this is charting is the number of companies in
7 the indices that were unprofitable. This
8 isn't a perfect metric, but it's kind of easy
9 to understand. And the point I am just trying
10 to make is the policies instituted over not
11 just the last two years, but over the last
12 several years has inefficiently allocated to
13 society scarce resources and created risk, if
14 you will. And you can see the number of the
15 unprofitable companies in the benchmarks
16 today; it's higher than where it was in 2008,
17 it's higher than where it was during the tech
18 bubble in 2009. So think about this and I
19 will wrap up my -- up my comments.

20 Just go to the next and almost last
21 slide. So looking forward, I think the
22 prospects for more stimulus are about as low
23 as they can possibly be because we know the
24 price hike for that; it's 7, 8, 9 percent
25 inflation. Central banks have to correct

0100

1 Proceedings

2 their mistake and bring down their aggregate
3 demand. They have to and they have made that
4 very clear. The consequence for that is it's
5 going to expose those corporations with
6 vulnerabilities and one of my concerns or
7 areas of vulnerability, if I can phrase it
8 like that, this is looking at the cost of
9 people so wages. And one of the ways that
10 companies are able to generate such high
11 profit margins in such a low-growth
12 environment is just simply underpaying people
13 and what you can see here is that's reversing.
14 I don't need to show this in a chart to any of
15 you that have gone to your favorite restaurant
16 and you had to wait longer than you should

17 because they just can't staff. I don't know
18 if you are having this problem with teachers;
19 we are having it with bus drivers, the bus
20 drivers in my town. There is a shortage of
21 labor everywhere. Economists want to blame it
22 on the pandemic. If you look back at every
23 pandemic in history, we went back a thousand
24 years, the common pattern is a change in
25 attitude if you will. The great resignation,

0101

1 Proceedings

2 but the pandemic came at the worst possible
3 time; it was a spark that lit the fire. The
4 kindling was years and years of labor giving
5 share to ownership, owners of capital if you
6 will. So now the U.S. or the European labor,
7 it's now they are pushing back and this is
8 companies biggest expense; this is companies
9 biggest cost. So as growth reverts back to
10 where it was pre-corona, as revenues fall back
11 to where it was pre-corona, what's different
12 versus the last 30 years is household
13 resources.

14 We can go to the last page. So to bring
15 it all together, I realize it sounds like a
16 bearish message and an unhappy and unpleasant
17 one and it is. However, I am genuinely -- we
18 are genuinely enthusiastic about this because
19 finally we are able to showcase the value of
20 discretionary portfolios. So when something
21 is abundant, it's not worth a lot. So if
22 everyone could run really fast, you know, we
23 would all play for the New York Giants. But,
24 you know, people with a unique skill get paid
25 a lot because they have something that's

0102

1 Proceedings

2 scarce. So conversely when there is something
3 that's not scarce, in abundance, it's not
4 worth very much. And as I showed you in the
5 2010s, profit generation, market accretion,
6 however you want to think about it was
7 massively abundant. Everything is different
8 now; deflation to inflation, quantitative
9 easing to quantitative tightening,
10 deregulation to re-regulation, globalization
11 to nationalism. All of this increases the
12 cost of doing business and it's going to
13 expose companies that probably should not have
14 been around as long as they have.

15 And I will end with the markets.
16 Financial markets have a -- this is going to
17 sound corny, but a real beautiful natural
18 selection process. So inefficiencies grow,

19 but then the market wakes up and it kills
20 companies. It killed banks in '08 because
21 they were behaving or acting in an
22 unsustainable way. It put those banks out of
23 business. I would offer in the last 10, 12,
24 13 years financial markets, investors weren't
25 -- their natural selection process was

0103

1 Proceedings

2 hindered or intervened by central banks. And
3 as all of that reverses, those companies -- I
4 hope they are in your portfolios. We think
5 they are -- that has had something that's
6 sustainable and durable, they are going to be
7 worth more, a lot more because they will be
8 scarce. That's what we are really excited
9 about.

10 So let me stop there and happy to take
11 questions, comments.

12 MS. PENNY: That's a great presentation.

13 MR. ALMEIDA: Thank you. You made my
14 day.

15 MS. PENNY: Very interesting. I guess
16 not. Thank you for joining us.

17 Oh, question.

18 MR. BUCKLEY: So, I guess, are you
19 advocating for a return to value over growth
20 investing?

21 MR. ALMEIDA: That's more yes, it's more
22 discretionary over not discretionary.

23 MS. STANG: Or active versus passive,
24 that's what you are saying?

25 MR. ALMEIDA: Yes, the value of growth

0104

1 Proceedings

2 just for the way I answer that question
3 because I get that quite a bit and it's a very
4 good one. It's often the opposite of what
5 most people think. Growth stocks outperform
6 when there is no growth. Value stocks
7 outperform when there is a lot of growth. So
8 value stocks generally are mature companies
9 that sell widgets and so the economy is doing
10 better, you have more assets to buy a new car,
11 buy another television. Generally, mature
12 goods. When growth is weak, those companies
13 that have outside growth become really scarce.
14 So I am excited. I don't know which will
15 outperform more, but I am excited for the
16 power of active within each universe.

17 MR. BUCKLEY: Thank you.

18 MS. PENNY: All right, thank you again.

19 MR. GREGOR: Thanks so much.

20 MS. PENNY: Okay. So is there anything

21 else, Mike?
22 MR. FULVIO: That concluded the public
23 session for Passport.
24 MS. PENNY: Anything else for public
25 session before we go into executive?
0105
1 Proceedings
2 Okay, do I hear a motion to go into
3 executive session?
4 MR. BROWN: So moved.
5 MS. PENNY: Thank you, Mr. Brown.
6 Do I have a second?
7 MS. HIRSH: Second.
8 MS. PENNY: Thank you, Ms. Hirsh.
9 Any questions or concerns? Great. All
10 in favor, please say aye.
11 Aye.
12 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.
13 MR. RAY: Aye.
14 MS. HIRSH: Aye.
15 MR. BROWN: Aye.
16 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.
17 MS. PENNY: Any opposed? Any
18 abstentions?
19 Okay, we are moving into executive
20 session. Thank you, everyone, for joining us.
21 (Discussion off the record.)
22 MS. PENNY: Welcome again. We are now
23 MS. PENNY: Okay, welcome back. We are
24 back into public session. Ms. Stang, would
25

0106
1 Proceedings
2 you please report out?
3 MS. STANG: Certainly.
4 In executive session we received a
5 manager contract update. We received an
6 update on an investment initiative. We
7 received some preliminary performance results
8 and an in-depth overview of our public equity
9 program. We received presentations on two
10 infrastructure investments. Consensus was
11 reached. We received a presentation on an
12 alternative credit investment. Consensus was
13 reached.
14 MS. PENNY: Thank you so much. Does
15 anyone have anything else for this meeting?
16 Hearing none, do I hear a motion to adjourn?
17 MR. BROWN: So moved.
18 MS. PENNY: Thank you, Mr. Brown.
19 Do I hear a second?
20 MS. HIRSH: Second.
21 MS. PENNY: Any questions? All those in
22 favor, please say aye.

23 Aye.
24 MS. HIRSH: Aye.
25 MR. BROWN: Aye.
0107
1 Proceedings
2 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.
3 MS. PENNY: Okay, thank you. We stand
4 adjourned.
5 [Time noted: 3:04 p.m.]
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

0108
1
2
3 C E R T I F I C A T E
4 STATE OF NEW YORK)
5 : ss.
6 COUNTY OF QUEENS)
7
8 I, YAFFA KAPLAN, a Notary Public
9 within and for the State of New York, do
10 hereby certify that the foregoing record of
11 proceedings is a full and correct
12 transcript of the stenographic notes taken
13 by me therein.
14 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
15 set my hand this 18th day of September,
16 2022.
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

YAFFA KAPLAN